



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 7108

Title: Lifetime risk of esophageal adenocarcinoma in patients with Barrett's esophagus (columnar-lined esophagus)

Reviewer code: 02545157

Science editor: Zhai, Huan-Huan

Date sent for review: 2013-11-05 15:32

Date reviewed: 2013-11-08 03:24

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This study by Gatenby et.al, confirms and provides additional evidence supporting the low dysplasia/cancer progression rates in individuals with Barrett's esophagus. The study is well conducted and the authors also compare recent population-based estimates and apply to their own cohort. Following are my comments. 1) One of the major clinical challenges in this field is identifying those Barrett's patients who are at an increased risk of developing esophageal adenocarcinoma, which may depend on both genetic and environmental factors. It would have been useful if the authors can provide us with information on some of the epidemiological risk factors in their study cohort. For example, since obesity/high BMI etc. are considered general risk factors for cancer, have the authors estimated the Obesity rates in their Barrett's cohort at the entry point? Also, what proportion of their BE patients had reflux disease?



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 7108

Title: Lifetime risk of esophageal adenocarcinoma in patients with Barrett's esophagus (columnar-lined esophagus)

Reviewer code: 00189934

Science editor: Zhai, Huan-Huan

Date sent for review: 2013-11-05 15:32

Date reviewed: 2013-11-25 05:39

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript of Piers Gatenby et al. evaluates and discusses an important question, namely the lifetime risk of esophageal adenocarcinoma development in patients with Barrett's esophagus (columnar-lined esophagus). Although the actuality of the topic is evident, it may not be accepted as it is, only after the suggested corrections. Major comment: Columnar lined esophagus (CLE) may not be used as a synonym for Barrett's esophagus. CLE includes gastric metaplasia as well (-> Montreal definition of GERD). According to the most recent AGA guidelines real risk for cancer development was established only in patients with specialized intestinal metaplasia (SIM). Furthermore, a recent work of Rosztoczy et al. (Digestion. 2011; 84(4): 273-80.) showed, that patients with different types of esophageal metaplasia and dysplasia have significant differences in the degree of their acidic and biliary reflux. This paper should be mentioned in the introduction, after reference 1, since it has much more concrete data regarding the pathophysiological background of BE (and other esophageal metaplasias). As a consequence please indicate in the section of methods, that all of the studied patients had SIM. If this is not the case please indicate the percentage of patients with SIM. If patients with esophageal metaplasias other than SIM were included all of the studied parameters should be calculated for both subgroups (patients with and without SIM). Minor comment: Authors should add their own values to the tables in a separate row. This would improve the understanding of the results significantly.



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 7108

Title: Lifetime risk of esophageal adenocarcinoma in patients with Barrett's esophagus (columnar-lined esophagus)

Reviewer code: 00831111

Science editor: Zhai, Huan-Huan

Date sent for review: 2013-11-05 15:32

Date reviewed: 2013-12-02 00:50

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors estimate the lifetime risk of development of esophageal adenocarcinoma or the combined end-point of high-grade dysplasia or adenocarcinoma in patients diagnosed with Barrett's esophagus. I have some minor concerns: 1. Is there any difference of lifetime risk of adenocarcinoma or adenocarcinoma and high grade dysplasia in combination between intestinal metaplasia-type and non-intestinal metaplasia-type Barrett's esophagus? 2. The discussion is too long and may be shortened.