



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5403

Title: Acute cytomegalovirus infection in liver transplant recipients: An independent risk for venous thromboembolism

Reviewer code: 00502960

Science editor: Ma, Ya-Juan

Date sent for review: 2013-09-05 11:32

Date reviewed: 2013-09-12 20:41

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Figure 1 is of poor quality. I am unable to see any CMV inclusion body in cells indicated by the arrow.



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5403

Title: Acute cytomegalovirus infection in liver transplant recipients: An independent risk for venous thromboembolism

Reviewer code: 00742216

Science editor: Ma, Ya-Juan

Date sent for review: 2013-09-05 11:32

Date reviewed: 2013-09-26 11:31

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This report by Edula et al. presents a case who underwent orthotopic liver transplantation (OLT), and suffered from a cytomegalovirus (CMV)-induced venous thromboembolism. To date, there have been many reports of the CMV infection after OLT. CMV-induced thromboembolism is also a well-known disease. I think this reports has a novelty, in that this case was related to all these pieces. Unfortunately, however, the information about the patient is lacking and the clinical significance of this report is marginal. I suggest the authors should add more clinical data. Major points: i) The information of the donor patient is lacking. It is unclear whether donor individual was CMV-sero-positive or not. ii) To date, there have been many reports of the CMV-associated portal thrombus after OLT (e.g., Transplantation. 1998 Aug 15;66(3):294-7, Transplant Proc. 2003 Feb;35(1):421-2). The authors should re-examine the possibility of portal thrombus in this case, and should discuss the clinical significance of thrombosis in the leg after OLT. Minor points: i) Title: "real risk or myth" should be changed into more academic phrase. ii) The data of the patient should be shown precisely; i.e., CMV-Igm titers, factor VIII, and protein S. iii) p.2, last paragraph, the sentence 'a case control ...' should be provided with the reference. iv) To verify the diagnosis of this disease, a figure representing the CT/echo-image of thrombosis is desirable.



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5403

Title: Acute cytomegalovirus infection in liver transplant recipients: An independent risk for venous thromboembolism

Reviewer code: 00012406

Science editor: Ma, Ya-Juan

Date sent for review: 2013-09-05 11:32

Date reviewed: 2013-10-03 22:23

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The paper entitled "Acute Cytomegalovirus infection in liver transplant recipients: An independent risk for venous thromboembolism: Real risk or a myth!" by Raja GR Edula is well written even present a single case. The title is not strictly corresponding to the conclusion. This reviewer suggests to eliminate the sentence "Real risk or a myth!".